

مآخذشناسی فرضیه دو کعبه‌ای (کعبه جنوب حجاز در مکه کنونی و کعبه شمال حجاز در منطقه پترا)

کاظم استادی^۱

۱. نویسنده مسئول، گروه تاریخ/تاریخ اسلام، دانشگاه باقرالعلوم، قم، ایران، رایانامه: kazemostadi@gmail.com

چکیده

اطلاعات مقاله

کعبه به‌عنوان مقدس‌ترین اماکن اسلامی، جایگاهی فراتر از یک بنای تاریخی یا آیینی دارد؛ و به نوعی نماد «توحید، وحدت، و هویت دینی» مسلمانان در بستر تاریخ اسلام محسوب می‌گردد. این مکان الهی که به حضرت ابراهیم (ع) نسبت داده شده، در قرآن به‌عنوان مرکز هدایت برای همه انسان‌ها معرفی گشته و در ساختار مناسک حج و قبله‌گاه مسلمانان نقش محوری ایفا می‌کند. اهمیت کعبه نه تنها در عبادت بلکه در ساخت هویت جمعی و سیاسی امت اسلامی جلوه‌گر است. اما در چند دهه اخیر، برخی پژوهشگران غربی با نگاه‌های تاریخی و انتقادی، فرضیه‌هایی درباره خاستگاه اولیه اسلام و جغرافیای آن و نیز، ایده وجود دو کعبه در جنوب (مکه کنونی) و شمال حجاز (پترا) مطرح نموده‌اند. در این میان، کتاب‌هایی چون «هاجرسم» و نیز «قبله‌های آغازین اسلامی» سوالات جدیدی در این باره ایجاد کرده‌اند. به نظر می‌رسد که فرضیه چندگانگی در کعبه ابراهیمی با ابهام در جغرافیای آن و نیز تبیین خاستگاه نخستین اسلام، در اول راه خود می‌باشد؛ و نیاز است تا اندیشمندان و پژوهشگران، ابعاد مختلف این دیدگاه‌ها را مورد بررسی و ارزیابی خود قرار دهند. به همین منظور، ارایه یک مآخذشناسی جامع در این مسائل، ضروری می‌باشد. مقاله حاضر با معرفی بیش از دویست اثر مستقیم و مرتبط با خاستگاه نخستین اسلام، تلاش دارد که بستری علمی برای ورود پرنگ‌تر محققان به این حوزه پرسش‌برانگیز و نوظهور را فراهم آورد؛ تا ابعاد مسائل آن، بیشتر و دقیق‌تر مورد پژوهش قرار گیرند.

نوع مقاله:

مقاله پژوهشی

تاریخ دریافت: ۱۴۰۳/۱۲/۲۵

تاریخ بازنگری: ۱۴۰۴/۰۱/۲۲

تاریخ پذیرش: ۱۴۰۴/۰۲/۰۵

تاریخ انتشار: ۱۴۰۴/۰۳/۲۸

کلیدواژه‌ها:

تاریخ اسلام،
تاریخ کعبه،
تاریخ مکه،
هاجرسم،
پترا،
گیسون.

استناد: استادی، کاظم (۱۴۰۴). مآخذشناسی فرضیه دو کعبه‌ای (کعبه جنوب حجاز در مکه کنونی و کعبه شمال حجاز در منطقه پترا). میراث اسلامی و چالش‌های معاصر، ۱ (۱)، ۱۶۵-۲۰۰. <https://doi.org/10.48309/ihcc.2025.548594.1011>



© نویسندگان.

ناشر: انتشارات سامی.

۱. مقدمه

کعبه، به عنوان مقدس‌ترین مکان اسلامی، جایگاهی فراتر از یک بنای تاریخی یا آیینی دارد. این بنا نماد توحید، وحدت و هویت دینی مسلمانان در طول تاریخ اسلام است. در قرآن کریم، کعبه به عنوان ﴿أَوَّلَ بَيْتٍ وُضِعَ لِلنَّاسِ﴾ (آل عمران: ۹۶)، مرکز هدایت برای همه انسان‌ها و قبله‌گاه یکپارچه مسلمانان معرفی شده است. پیوند کعبه با حضرت ابراهیم (ع) و فرزندش اسماعیل (ع) در بازسازی آن (بقره: ۱۲۷)، و نیز نقش محوری آن در مناسک حج، بر جایگاه بی‌بدیلش در عبادت و ساخت هویت جمعی و سیاسی امت اسلامی تأکید دارد. تغییر قبله از مسجدالاقصی به سوی کعبه (بقره: ۱۴۴) نیز نشانه‌ای از استقلال هویتی اسلام و تمرکز بر مرکز توحید ابراهیمی محسوب می‌شود.

با این حال، در چند دهه اخیر، رویکردهای تاریخ‌نگارانه انتقادی در مطالعات اسلامی، به ویژه از سوی برخی پژوهشگران غربی، پرسش‌هایی اساسی درباره خاستگاه اولیه اسلام و جغرافیای تاریخی آن مطرح کرده‌اند. در کانون این پرسش‌ها، «فرضیه دو کعبه‌ای» قرار دارد که مدعی است برخلاف روایت سنتی، در صدر اسلام دو مرکز عبادی مهم وجود داشته است: یکی در جنوب حجاز (مکه کنونی) و دیگری در شمال حجاز (منطقه پترا در اردن امروزی). کتاب‌های تأثیرگذاری مانند «هاجرسم» اثر پاتریشیا کرون و مایکل کوک (۱۹۷۷) و «قبله‌های آغازین اسلامی» اثر دن گیسون (۲۰۱۷)، مبانی این فرضیه را بنا نهاده و واکنش‌های گسترده‌ای را در محافل علمی برانگیخته‌اند. این چکیده تفصیلی، با هدف ارائه یک مآخذشناسی جامع از این حوزه پژوهی نوظهور، بستری مناسب برای ورود محققان و نقد و بررسی دقیق‌تر این نظریه‌ها فراهم می‌کند.

۲. روش تحقیق

این مقاله با روش «مآخذشناسی توصیفی-تحلیلی» و با هدف گردآوری جامع‌ترین فهرست از آثار مرتبط با فرضیه دو کعبه‌ای و خاستگاه نخستین اسلام تدوین شده است. روش گردآوری داده‌ها، جستجوی نظام‌مند و گسترده در پایگاه‌های اطلاعاتی معتبر فارسی و لاتین، منابع کتابخانه‌ای، سایت‌های تخصصی و حتی کانال‌های علمی در شبکه‌های اجتماعی بوده است. معیار گزینش آثار، مستقیم یا قوی بودن ارتباط آن‌ها با محورهای اصلی پژوهش، یعنی نظریه‌های جایگزین درباره مکان کعبه و جغرافیای تاریخی صدر اسلام بوده است. در نهایت، بیش از ۲۰۰ اثر (شامل کتاب، مقاله، پایان‌نامه، مستند و یادداشت‌های علمی) شناسایی، فهرست‌بندی و بر اساس نام خانوادگی

پدیدآورندگان به صورت الفبایی سازماندهی شده است. افزون بر فهرست‌گذاری، مقاله به ارائه خلاصه‌ای از زندگی‌نامه و آرای کلیدی‌ترین نظریه‌پردازان این حوزه، یعنی کرون، کوک و گیسون نیز پرداخته تا چارچوب نظری لازم برای فهم بهتر منابع فراهم آید.

۳. یافته‌های تحقیق

یافته‌های این تحقیق را می‌توان در سه محور اصلی دسته‌بندی کرد: الف) معرفی نظریه‌پردازان و هسته مرکزی فرضیه‌ها، ب) ارائه فهرستی گسترده از منابع، و ج) اشاره به نقدهای وارد بر این نظریه‌ها.

الف) نظریه‌پردازان و چارچوب‌های فکری

- **هاجر یسم کرون و کوک:** کتاب «هاجر یسم: پدیدآمدن جهان اسلام» (۱۹۷۷) سنگ بنای جریان انتقادی رادیکال در مطالعات صدر اسلام است. کرون (۲۰۱۵-۱۹۴۵) و کوک (متولد ۱۹۴۰) با رویکردی شدیداً شکاکانه به منابع سنتی اسلامی، و با اولویت دادن به منابع غیرمسلمان هم‌عصر (یونانی، سریانی، ارمنی)، استدلال می‌کنند که اسلام اولیه نه یک دین مستقل، بلکه جنبشی سیاسی-قومی تحت عنوان «هاجر یسم» بوده است. به زعم آنان، این جنبش متشکل از قبایل عرب و گروه‌های یهودی با هدف بازسازی هویت اسماعیلی و مقابله با امپراتوری بیزانس شکل گرفت. پیامبر اسلام (ص) در این خوانش، ابتدا رهبری قومی-دینی بود و بسیاری از مؤلفه‌های متمایزکننده اسلام (مانند قرآن مکتوب، فقه و حدیث) محصول قرون دوم و سوم هجری هستند. اگرچه این نظریه بعدها توسط خود کرون (مثلاً در کتاب «تجارت مکه و خاستگاه اسلام»، ۱۹۸۷) تعدیل شد، اما همچنان به عنوان یکی از اثرگذارترین و جنجال‌برانگیزترین آثار در این حوزه شناخته می‌شود.

- **فرضیه پترا اثر دن گیسون:** دن گیسون، پژوهشگر و مستندساز کانادایی، با اتکا به روش‌های باستان‌شناختی و تحلیل میدانی، نظریه‌ای متمایز اما مرتبط را ارائه داده است. او در آثاری مانند «جغرافیای قرآنی» (۲۰۱۱) و به ویژه «قبله‌های آغازین اسلامی» (۲۰۱۷) ادعا می‌کند که مکان مقدس اولیه در اسلام، شهر پترا در شمال حجاز (اردن کنونی) بوده، نه مکه کنونی. دلایل عمده او برای این ادعا عبارتند از:

۱. تحلیل جهت قبله مساجد اولیه: بررسی بیش از ۱۰۰ مسجد ساخته‌شده بین سال‌های ۱ تا ۲۶۳ هجری نشان می‌دهد که جهت قبله آن‌ها به سمت پترا تنظیم شده، نه مکه.

۲. تحلیل جهت قبله مساجد اولیه: توصیف‌های قرآن از چشماندازهای کوهستانی، بارش باران، باغ‌ها و درختان انگور با اقلیم پترا سازگارتر است تا با محیط خشک مکه.
۳. فقدان شواهد باستان‌شناسی: به زعم گیبسون، شواهد باستان‌شناسی معتبری از وجود شهری به نام مکه با پیشینه تجاری قوی تا پیش از قرن دوم هجری در دست نیست.
۴. تحولات سیاسی: گیبسون تغییر قبله به سمت مکه را نتیجه سیاست‌های خلفای عباسی برای ایجاد مرکزیت دینی جدید در اواسط قرن دوم هجری می‌داند.

ب) فهرست گسترده منابع

- این پژوهش با معرفی بیش از ۲۰۰ اثر، گنجینه‌ای ارزشمند برای پژوهشگران فراهم کرده است. این منابع شامل موارد زیر هستند:
- آثار اصلی نظریه‌پردازان (مانند آثار کرون، کوک، گیبسون، پپ، اولیگ، لوکزنگرگ).
 - آثار منتقدان این نظریه‌ها (مانند نقدهای تفصیلی دیوید ای. کینگ بر روش‌شناسی گیبسون).
 - منابع سنتی و تاریخی اسلامی (مانند «کتاب الاصنام» ابن کلبی).
 - مقالات، پایان‌نامه‌ها و یادداشت‌های علمی به زبان‌های فارسی، عربی و انگلیسی که به نقد و بررسی این فرضیه‌ها پرداخته‌اند.
 - مستندها و منابع رسانه‌ای (مانند مستند «شهر مقدس» ساخته دن گیبسون).
- این فهرست نه تنها آثار مستقیم، بلکه منابع مرتبط با خاستگاه اسلام، تاریخ مکه، باستان‌شناسی حجاز و مطالعات قرآنی را نیز در بر می‌گیرد.

ج) نقدها و واکنش‌ها

یافته دیگر این مقاله، اشاره به فضای پویای نقد و مناظره حول این فرضیه‌هاست. برای نمونه، دیوید ای. کینگ، تاریخ‌دان علم، به شدت روش‌های گیبسون در تحلیل جهت قبله مساجد را غیردقیق و فاقد پایه‌های علمی می‌داند و ادعای تغییر سیستماتیک قبله در دوره عباسی را رد می‌کند. به طور کلی، منتقدان، رویکرد شکاکانه افراطی به منابع اسلامی، تکیه بر شواهد غیرمستقیم و گاه تفسیرهای خاص از داده‌های باستان‌شناسی را از نقاط ضعف اصلی این نظریه‌ها می‌دانند.

۴. نتیجه‌گیری

فرضیه دو کعبه‌ای و به طور کلی، بازخوانی انتقادی خاستگاه اسلام و جغرافیای تاریخی آن، اگرچه از سوی جریان اصلی مطالعات اسلامی و نهادهای دینی رد شده، اما به عنوان حوزه‌ای پرسش‌برانگیز و نوظهور در محافل آکادمیک غرب و حتی در میان برخی محققان داخلی مطرح است. این چکیده تفصیلی و مقاله پشتیبان آن، با ارائه یک مآخذشناسی نظام‌مند و نسبتاً کامل که بیش از ۲۰۰ اثر را در بر می‌گیرد، نشان می‌دهد که این بحث تنها محدود به چند کتاب مشهور نیست، بلکه شبکه‌ای در حال گسترش از پژوهش‌ها، نقدها و واکنش‌ها را تشکیل داده است. اهمیت این مآخذشناسی در آن است که بستری علمی و منسجم برای محققان علاقه‌مند فراهم می‌آورد تا بدون سردرگمی در انبوه پراکنده منابع، بتوانند با مهم‌ترین چارچوب‌های نظری (مانند هاجریسم کرون و کوک و فرضیه پترای گیبسون)، مهم‌ترین متون اصلی و ثانویه، و نیز مهم‌ترین نقدهای وارد بر آن‌ها آشنا شوند. این کار، امکان ورود به این عرصه پژوهشی پیچیده را تسهیل و زمینه را برای نقد و بررسی دقیق‌تر، عمیق‌تر و مستندتر این دیدگاه‌ها فراهم می‌سازد. در نهایت، باید تأکید کرد که بررسی این فرضیه‌ها نه تنها یک تمرین آکادمیک محض، که تلاشی برای فهم بهتر پیچیدگی‌های تاریخ صدر اسلام و تعامل میان متن، تاریخ، باستان‌شناسی و ایدئولوژی است. این مقاله با نقشه‌برداری از منابع این حوزه، گامی اولیه اما ضروری برای واکاوی هرچه بیشتر ابعاد این مسئله برمی‌دارد و انجام پژوهش‌های تطبیقی و بینارشته‌ای بیشتر را طلب می‌کند.

Bibliography of the Two Kaaba Hypothesis (The Southern Hijaz Kaaba in Present-Day Mecca and the Northern Hijaz Kaaba in the Petra Region)

Kazem Ostadi¹ 

1. Corresponding Author, Department of History/Islamic History, Baqir al-Olum University, Qom, Iran. Email: kazemostadi@gmail.com

Article Info

Article type:
Research Article

Article history:

Received: 15 March 2025

Received in revised form:
11 April 2025

Accepted: 25 April 2025

Available online: 10 March 2025

Keywords:

History of Islam,
History of the Kaaba,
History of Mecca,
Hagarism,
Petra,
Gibson.

ABSTRACT

The Kaaba, as the holiest site in Islam, holds a status beyond that of a mere historical or ritual structure; it is considered a symbol of "monotheism, unity, and religious identity" for Muslims throughout Islamic history. This divine site, attributed to the Prophet Abraham (AS), is introduced in the Qur'an as the center of guidance for all humanity and plays a pivotal role in the rites of Hajj and as the Qibla for Muslims. The significance of the Kaaba is manifest not only in worship but also in the construction of the collective and political identity of the Islamic Ummah. However, in recent decades, some Western scholars, through historical and critical perspectives, have proposed hypotheses concerning the early origins of Islam and its geography, including the idea of two Kaabas in the southern (present-day Mecca) and northern Hijaz (Petra). In this context, works such as Hagarism and Early Islamic Qiblas have raised new questions on this matter. It appears that the hypothesis of multiplicity regarding the Abrahamic Kaaba, or ambiguity concerning its geography, as well as explanations for the initial origin of Islam, remain in their early stages. Consequently, it is necessary for thinkers and researchers to examine and evaluate the various dimensions of these viewpoints. To this end, providing a comprehensive bibliography on these issues is essential. This article, by introducing over two hundred primary and secondary sources related to the early origins of Islam, aims to provide a scholarly foundation for researchers to engage more substantially with this emerging and contentious field, so that its various aspects may be investigated more thoroughly and precisely.

Cite this article: Ostadi, K. (2025). Bibliography of the Two Kaaba Hypothesis (The Southern Hijaz Kaaba in Present-Day Mecca and the Northern Hijaz Kaaba in the Petra Region). *Islamic Heritage and Contemporary Challenges*, 1 (1), 165-200.

<https://doi.org/10.48309/ihcc.2025.548594.1011>



© The Author(s).

Publisher: Sami Publishing Company (SPC).

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.48309/ihcc.2025.548594.1011>

1. Introduction

The Kaaba is not only one of the holiest sites in Islam but also the starting point and the monotheistic axis of the Islamic faith. It is the first house established for the worship of God on Earth (Āl 'Imrān, 96) and thus holds a status beyond that of a sacred building; the Kaaba is the embodiment of unity, faith, and the devotional-social axis of Muslims throughout Islamic history. The Qur'an presents the Kaaba not merely as a structure belonging to a specific people, but as a center of guidance for all humanity.

The Kaaba's history predates the Islamic Shari'ah, tracing back to the era of the Prophet Abraham (AS). In the Qur'an, the reconstruction and purification of the House of God by Abraham and his son Ishmael is recounted as a foundational event; when the two "raised the foundations of the House" and asked God to accept their work (al-Baqarah, 127). Thus, from a monotheistic perspective, the Kaaba is not merely a geographical location but a point where purity of intention, sincere devotion, and submission to the divine command are manifested. Abraham's role in establishing religious rites surrounding the Kaaba, including circumambulation (ṭawāf) and sacrifice, is also emphasized in the Qur'an (al-Ḥajj, 26-27).

The Kaaba holds special importance as the Qibla (direction of prayer) for Muslims. After the migration (Hijrah) of the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) to Medina, the Qibla of the Muslims was changed by divine command from Jerusalem to the Kaaba, a clear sign of the independent identity of the Islamic Ummah and its focus on the Abrahamic center of monotheism (al-Baqarah, 144). This change in direction was not merely a ritual instruction but a strategic statement of a return to the pure roots of monotheism and the continuation of the connection between Islam and the Abrahamic faith.

Furthermore, the Kaaba is a place where security is guaranteed; God refers to it as a "Secure Sanctuary" (al-Mā'idah, 97). The importance of this characteristic is doubly evident in the world of yesterday and today, where religious and social security is compromised in many regions. In this regard, the Qur'an emphasizes that people are obliged to respect the sanctity of this place and *to preserve it from any act of violence or desecration* (al-Baqarah, 191).

In addition to its devotional role, the Kaaba is also the axis of social unity for Muslims. During the Hajj pilgrimage, one of the pillars of Islam, millions of Muslims from around the world, with diverse languages, colors, and ethnicities gather at the Kaaba. This massive gathering, which the Qur'an describes as providing "benefits for the people" (al-Ḥajj, 28), is a practical manifestation of community-building and the unity of the Islamic Ummah. Thus, the Kaaba is, on one hand, a place of worship and submission to God, and on the other, an arena for harmonizing hearts and unifying the Islamic Ummah.

Ultimately, it can be said that the Kaaba is a symbol of the divine covenant; a house that God has established as "a support for mankind" (al-Mā'idah, 97), meaning a source of stability and steadfastness for people. This expression, which also carries socio-political connotations, indicates that the Muslim's connection with the Kaaba is not merely an emotional or ritual relationship; rather, at its core, it entails a form of social, historical, and ethical responsibility.

Therefore, the Qur'an not only considers the Kaaba a sacred and symbolic edifice but, by emphasizing its "history, philosophy, rites, and spirituality," elevates it to a transcendent, timeless status—the beating heart of the believers and the eternal symbol of monotheism.

2. Statement of the Problem

Upon reflection on the empirical history of humankind and even the historical developments of religions and denominations, it becomes clear that certain matters and subjects, seemingly "self-evident" and considered historical certainties, *may, through scholarly inquiry, become subjects of renewed contemplation* and re-evaluation, thereby losing some of their apparent obviousness. In this process, some individuals, in order to resolve difficulties and provide adequate answers to these questions, propose *new approaches to explain those very issues*, and some go even further by presenting diverse, opposing, or even radical hypotheses to challenge those established common beliefs and conventions.

For instance, in recent decades, some Western scholars (such as Montgomery Watt, Michael Cook, Patricia Crone, Gerald Hawting,

Christoph Luxenberg (pseudonym), Fred M. Donner, Dan Gibson, and Volker Popp), through their studies and research on the history of Islam and its cultural and political roots, have introduced ambiguities regarding the origin of Islam or its initial geography. Certainly, the works of some of these scholars have gained more fame and attention, such as Cook and Crone's book *Hagarism* (1977) and Gibson's book *Early Islamic Qiblas* (2017), which have provoked widespread reactions in academic and media circles.

It appears that the hypothesis of a multiplicity of Abrahamic Kaabas, or ambiguity concerning its geography, as well as explanations for the initial origin of Islam, are still in their early stages. Consequently, it is necessary for thinkers and researchers to examine and evaluate the various dimensions of these viewpoints. To this end, providing a bibliography concerning the Two Kaaba Hypothesis (the southern Hijaz Kaaba in present-day Mecca and the northern Hijaz Kaaba in the Petra region) and the early origin of Islam is essential. This will enable those interested in pursuing these topics to enter the field of study, critique, and discussion of related issues more effectively and precisely.

Accordingly, through extensive searches in Persian and Western sources, specialized works in this field and indirect but relevant sources have been identified. These are presented to the readers, accompanied by brief introductory summaries of the prominent proposed hypotheses and biographies of their theorists, with the aim of providing a research infrastructure for entering this field.

3. Hagarism of Crone and Cook

Patricia Crone and Michael Cook, aside from their joint work titled *Hagarism: The Making of the Islamic World* (1977), have numerous other works in the field of early Islamic origins.

For example, Patricia Crone authored: 1- *Meccan Trade and the Rise of Islam* (1987). 2- *Review of The Origins of Islam* (1990). 3- *Early Islam: History, Sources, and Traditions* (1994). 4- *A Critique of Early Islamic Sources* (1998). 5- *Islam, History, and Civilization* (2003).

And Michael Cook authored: 1- *Review of Early Muslim Dogma* (1980). 2- *Muhammad* (1983). 3- *An Historical Analysis of the*

Origins of Islam (1985). 4- A Semantic Hadith on the Qibla in al-Kulayni's al-Kāfi (2015).

A brief account of their hypothesis is as follows:

3.1. Brief Biographies of Crone and Cook

Patricia Crone, one of the most prominent figures of the second generation of critical Orientalists, was born in Denmark in 1945. She began her university studies at the School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS) and subsequently received her PhD from the University of Oxford. She taught at the University of Cambridge and the School of Oriental Studies in London during the 1970s and 1980s, before joining the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton in 1997, where she remained as a faculty member until her death in 2015 (see: Cook, 2015: 1).

Crone played a significant role in shaping the critical trend in Western Islamic studies through her stringent approach to traditional Islamic sources. She believed that later Islamic sources could not be used uncritically in analyzing developments of the seventh century CE. This position, based on the utilization of non-Muslim sources and comparative analysis, had a profound impact on methodological debates in Islamic studies (see: Hoyland, 2015: 103).

Patricia Crone's scholarly character was known for a combination of "frankness, linguistic precision, mastery of classical sources, and a critical historical perspective." Her colleagues, including Professor Michael Cook, described her as a fearless yet truth-seeking researcher (see: Cook, 2015: 3).

She passed away in 2015 after a period of illness, but her scholarly legacy continues to inspire profound dialogue among contemporary scholars of Islam.

Michael Cook, one of the most influential contemporary scholars of Islam, was born in England in 1940. He began his university studies in history at the University of Cambridge and later received his PhD in Islamic history from the University of London. Cook joined the faculty of Princeton University in 1986 *where he taught for many years in the History Department* (see: Qāḍī, 2017: 556).

Cook's scholarly fame stems primarily from his research on the origins of Islam, the history of the Caliphate, and the development of Islamic thought, especially in the early periods. His research collaboration with Patricia Crone in writing *Hagarism* is considered a turning point in critical studies of early Islamic history. However, in his subsequent independent works, Cook distanced himself from that radical approach and turned to more historical analyses of "Islamic jurisprudence, ethics, and intellectual developments in Islamic civilization" (see: Cook, 2000: xii).

In addition to his deep knowledge of Islamic sources in Arabic, Persian, Turkish, and Hebrew, Cook is recognized as one of the most meticulous scholars of Islam in the analysis of classical texts. His views in the field of Islamic ethics, the role of religion in politics, and discourses on commanding right and forbidding wrong have influenced numerous scholars both within and outside the Muslim world (see: Brown, 2003: 103). In 2002, he received the "Brill Encyclopedia of Islam" award for his outstanding contributions and continues to serve as a distinguished professor at Princeton University.

3.2. Brief Explanation of the Hagarism Hypothesis

The authors of *Hagarism*, adopting a historiographical approach characterized by a critical stance toward traditional Islamic sources, attempt to reconstruct the history of early Islam by relying on contemporary non-Muslim texts such as Greek, Syriac, Hebrew, and Armenian sources. They argue that the narratives about the origin of Islam are the product of ideological revisions in later centuries and cannot be used as reliable evidence for the history of the seventh century CE (Crone and Cook, 1977: 3-7).

The authors use the term "Hagarism" to describe an early Arab-Jewish movement that emerged in opposition to the Byzantine Empire. According to them, this movement was not, from its inception, an independent religious movement but rather a politico-ethnic endeavor, organized through the cooperation of Arab tribes and some Jewish groups, with the aim of reconstructing an Ishmaelite identity and

breaking free from the domination of major empires. From this perspective, early Islam is a continuation of Abrahamic traditions, specifically influenced by Jewish tradition and Messianic expectations (Crone and Cook, 1977: 8-14).

According to Crone and Cook's interpretation, the Prophet of Islam (PBUH) was initially not the founder of an independent religion but a politico-religious leader who, along with his followers, identified himself as "Ishmaelites"—those who had allied with Jews to reclaim the Holy Land and restore the Abrahamic tradition. This alliance, however, fractured after the conquest of Jerusalem, and from this rupture, Islam gradually emerged as an independent religion. The authors believe that many distinctive elements of Islam—including the Qur'an in its written and codified form, jurisprudence (fiqh), Hadith, and the structure of the Caliphate—are products of the second and third centuries AH, not the first (Crone and Cook, 1977: 15-20).

One of the most significant methodological innovations of this book was its prioritization of external sources over Islamic ones. By examining Greek and Syriac texts contemporaneous with the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH), Crone and Cook argue that these sources indicate perceptions different from those that later formed within the Islamic tradition. For example, the authors cite the writings of the Armenian Sebeos and Thomas the Presbyter, pointing to evidence where the Prophet of Islam is introduced as a tribal leader with political objectives, not a prophet receiving revelation (Crone and Cook, 1977: 40-45).

This skeptical approach towards Islamic sources and heavy reliance on non-Muslim sources has prompted serious criticism from scholars of Islam. Critics considered this approach overly conjectural and lacking sufficient evidence. Particularly, the disregard for the internal dynamics of the Islamic tradition and the complexities in the development of Hadith and jurisprudence were identified as major weaknesses of this work. Even Crone, in her later works such as *Meccan Trade and the Rise of Islam* (1987), adopted a more cautious approach, revised and moderated some of her earlier radical positions.

Despite this, *Hagarism* remains an influential work in the historiography of Islam. By questioning traditional assumptions, the

book significantly opened up critical studies of Islam and paved the way for discourses such as re-reading Islam with a historical approach. Although its methodology remains contentious, its role in stimulating new research on early Islamic history is undeniable.

4. Petra and Gibson

Although he did not achieve the same depth as Crone and Cook, Dan Gibson has also produced numerous works on the early origins of Islam and the Two Kaaba Hypothesis, such as:

1. *Qur'anic Geography: A Survey and Evaluation of Geographical References in the Qur'an with Reference to Historical and Field Data* (2011).

2. *The Sacred City* Documentary (2016).

3. *Early Islamic Qiblas: A Study of the Mosques Built Between 1 AH/622 CE and 263 AH/876 CE* (2017).

4. *Let the Stones Speak: A New Look at the Archaeology of Islam* (2023).

A brief account of their hypothesis is as follows:

4.1. Brief Biography of Dan Gibson

Dan Gibson is a Canadian researcher, author, and documentary filmmaker, best known for his theories concerning early Islamic history and particularly his documentary *The Sacred City*. No independent book or article provides a comprehensive biography of him. Therefore, the available information about his life is primarily drawn from sources such as his personal website, the prefaces of his books, and his media interviews. His official website, nabataea.net, also provides information about his research and views.

Dan Gibson began extensive field studies in the Middle East in 1979, and residing for approximately three decades in Jordan, Yemen, and the United Arab Emirates. His primary focus has been on the historiography of early Islam, Nabatean civilization, and the geographical references in the Qur'an (Gibson, 2011: 8). He first introduced a research approach combining archaeological and textual analysis with the publication of *Qur'anic Geography* in 2011, aiming to

correlate locations mentioned in the Qur'an with historical and geographical data (Gibson, 2011).

He continued this approach, in his 2017 book *Early Islamic Qiblas*, he analyzed the Qibla orientations of over 200 historical mosques and claimed that in the early centuries of Islam, the Qibla of mosques was towards Petra in Jordan, not Mecca (Gibson, 2017: 132). This research was based on satellite data, field surveys, and historical documents independently collected by Gibson.

It is noteworthy that Gibson has not been affiliated with formal academic institutions. Nevertheless, his works have attracted the attention of some informal research circles.

4.2. Brief Explanation of Gibson's Hypothesis

Dan Gibson is best known for his book and documentary titled *The Sacred City*, in which he claims that the historical Mecca was originally located in the Petra region of modern-day southern Jordan, not in present-day Mecca in Saudi Arabia.

The Petra theory, developed by Dan Gibson in his works, posits that the initial sacred site in Islam was not Mecca but Petra in southern Jordan. This theory is based on multi-layered evidence, including Qur'anic geography, the Qiblas of early mosques, and early Islamic texts (Gibson, 2011: 117-132). Gibson argues that the geographical descriptions in the Qur'an, involving mountains, agriculture, and a relatively humid climate, are incompatible with the arid climate of Mecca and correspond better with the natural setting of Petra (see: Gibson, 2011: 89-93).

The culmination of this theory is seen in the book *Early Islamic Qiblas* (2017), where he examines data from over 100 early Islamic mosques and demonstrates that the vast majority of them were oriented towards Petra (see: Gibson, 2017: 45-132). According to Gibson, the change of the Qibla from Petra to Mecca occurred around the mid-second century AH, which he attributes to political developments under the Abbasid Caliphate (see: Gibson, 2017: 176).

The primary reasons put forward by Dan Gibson in support of the "Petra as the initial sacred site of Islam" theory are listed below:

a. **Qiblas of Early Mosques:** The examination of approximately 100 mosques from the first and second centuries AH indicates that their Qibla direction was set towards Petra instead of Mecca. Mosques in Damascus, Basra, Fustat, Wasit, and even in China have Qiblas that point precisely or approximately towards Petra (see: Gibson, 2017).

b. **Qur'anic Geographical Descriptions:** The Qur'an contains references to rainfall, gardens, palm trees, vines, and a mountainous region that align more naturally with the environment of the Petra region and the northern Hijaz than with Mecca. Specifically, terms such as *Wādin Dhī Zar'*, *Ṭūr Sīnīn*, and *al-Balad al-Amīn* are seen as more fitting the geographical location of Petra (see: Gibson, 2011: 85-97).

c. **Lack of Pre-Islamic Historical and Archaeological Evidence for Mecca:** Gibson claims that there is no reliable archaeological evidence for the city of Mecca until the eighth century CE (second century AH), whereas Petra had been an important cultural and commercial center for centuries prior to that time (see: Gibson, 2011: 10-30).

d. **Correlation with Islamic Narratives:** Some early Islamic historical narratives refer to northern Arabia, which aligns more closely with Petra's location. For instance, narratives concerning early Muslim conflicts with the Byzantines and descriptions of the geographical locations of Badr, Uhud, and Tabuk correspond better with the location of Petra (see: Gibson, 2011: 112-123).

e. **Cartography and Visual Evidence:** Using satellite imagery and analysis of precise maps, Gibson demonstrates that the Qibla angles of mosques were often deliberately engineered to face Petra, rather than being random or due to local geographical factors (see: Gibson, 2017: 46-130).

f. **Political Developments of the Abbasids:** He argues that the Abbasid caliphs, aiming to establish a new religious center, replaced Petra with Mecca as the official Qibla. This Qibla change coincided with the Abbasids establishing themselves in Baghdad and the formation of a more formal religious structure (see: Gibson, 2017: 176).

However, this theory and its evidence have been strongly criticized by scholars such as David A. King. In a detailed article titled "A Review of *Early Islamic Qiblas*," King points to serious contradictions in

Gibson's analyses and considers his findings imprecise and unscientific (see: King, 2018: 351-384). King regards Gibson's methods as lacking the necessary foundations in the science of Qibla determination. He writes that Gibson's understanding of historical architecture and Qibla finding is simplistic and at times incorrect (see: King, 2018: 360-384).

4.2. Brief Explanation of Gibson's Hypothesis

Before reviewing the alphabetical list of works based on authors' surnames, it is appropriate to note that some works may have been published by different publishers or with varying transliterations of surnames. Therefore, when searching for authors' names, it is necessary to consider all possible variant forms.

The list of works, organized by author, is as follows:.

Bibliography

- Ibn al-Kalbī, Hishām ibn Muḥammad (2000). *Kitāb al-Aṣnām (The Idols of the Arabs)*. Ed.: Aḥmad Zakī Ṣafwat. approx. 290 pp. Cairo: Dār al-Kutub al-Miṣriyyah. Persian translation: Kalbī, Hishām ibn Muḥammad (1348 SH). *Bot-hā-ye Arab (The Idols of the Arabs)*. Trans.: Yūsuf Faḍā'ī. 316 pp. Tehran: Atṭā'ī.
- Aḥmad, Mashhūd (2023). "Analyzing the Petra Theory of Early Islam: A Response to Tom Holland, J. Smith, and Dan Gibson." March 25. Website: <https://trueislam.co.uk/articles/petra-theory-of-early-islam/>.
- Aḥmadī, 'Alī (1398 SH). "The Role of Ibn 'Allān al-Makkī in Compiling the History of Mecca and Medina." *Journal of Miqāt al-Ḥajj*, Autumn, No. 109, pp. 139-158. [In Persian]
- Spencer, Robert B. (2012). *Did Muhammad Exist? An Inquiry Into Islam's Obscure Origins*. 362 pp. Wilmington: ISI Books.
- Ustādī, Kāzīm (1403-1404 SH). "Collection of Notes on the Two Kaaba Hypothesis and Petra." Telegram Channels "Bā Man Bemān" and "Dīn az Negāhī Dīgar". <https://t.me/kazimustadi> & <https://t.me/dinaznegahidigar>. (These notes, in order of writing date, include titles such as "The Petra Region and Imam Husayn (AS)", "Distant or Near Hagar", "The Two Kaaba Theory", etc., with provided URLs).
- Ismā'īlī, Mihrān (1398 SH). "Determining the Boundaries of Yathrib/Medina during the Prophet's Era; A Critical Approach to Orientalist Studies." *Historical Researches*, Spring, No. 41, pp. 35-49. [In Persian]
- Afrāsīyābī, Ghulām Riḍā (1383 SH). "The Foundation of the Kaaba (Parts 1 & 2)." *Ā'īneye Mīrāth*, Winter No. 23 & Spring No. 24, pp. 7-26 & 7-17. [In Persian]
- Akbar, Raḥmatullāh; Aslan, Aḥmad; Muṣṭafā Qaym, Raḥmatullāh (2022). "Methods of Calculating Qibla Direction in Islamic Astronomy Sources in Indonesia." *Aḥkām: Journal of Sharia Sciences*, Vol. 22, No. 2, pp. 385-410.
- Imām, Sayyid Jalāl (1386 SH). "The Kaaba and the Study of its Construction History in the Qur'an." *Ma'rifat*, Khordād, No. 114, pp. 55-74. [In Persian]
- Amīrah bint 'Alī Waṣfī Maddāḥ (1426 AH). "The Concern of the Ottomans with the Kiswah of the Noble Kaaba and its Development in the Modern Era 923 AH – 1346 AH / 1517 CE – 1927 CE." *Umm al-Qurā University*, Dhū al-Qa'dah, No. 35, pp. 141-210.

- Amīrzādah, Muḥammad ‘Alī (1388 SH). "A Text and a Mysterious History." Trans.: Majīd Muntazir Mahdī. *Haft Aseman*, Year 11, Summer, No. 42, pp. 35-56. [In Persian]
- Amir-Moezzi, Mohammad Ali and Dye, Guillaume (Eds.) (2019). *Le Coran des historiens (The Qur'an of the Historians)*. 3450+ pp. Paris: Éditions du Cerf.
- Anderson, Mark (2018). "Is Mecca or Petra the True Birthplace of Islam?" *Understanding Islam Today*. Available at: <https://understandingIslamtoday/is-mecca-or-petra-islams-true-birthplace> (Reviewed November 26, 2019).
- Anṣārī, Hādī (1399 SH). "Mecca or Petra; Which is the Muslims' Sacred City?" Online Note, Ordibehesht 9. Khabar Online Website. [In Persian]
- Oaks, Richard W. (2015). "Review of Qur'anic Geography." *The Muslim World*, Vol. 105, pp. 423-426.
- Ohlig, Karl-Heinz (2008). *The Hidden Origins of Islam: New Research into Its Early History*. 406 pp. New York: Prometheus Books.
- Ohlig, Karl-Heinz; Popp, Volker (2013). *The Beginnings of Islam: A Critical Reconstruction Based on Contemporary Sources*. Trans.: Javid Namjoo. 304 pp. Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books.
- İlci, Veli; Özülü, İbrahim Murat; Arslan, Ursava; Alkan, Raha Metin (2018). "Examining the Accuracy of Existing Qibla in Mosques from Different Periods: A Case Study in Çorum City, Turkey." *Technical Gazette*, Vol. 25, No. 6, pp. 1642-1649.
- Imhotep, Asher (2012). "Reexamining the Kaaba of Islam." 28 pp. unpublished PDF, August 2. Moka-Versity Institute of Philosophy and Research.
- Āzarnīvash, ‘Abbās ‘alī (1392 SH). "The Urbanization Movement in the Early Centuries of the Islamic Caliphate." *Journal of the History of Islamic Culture and Civilization*, Summer, No. 11, pp. 113-134. [In Persian]
- Āṣif Fikrat, Muḥammad (1370 SH). "The First Garment that the Khorasanians Dressed the Kaaba With." *Mishkāt*, Autumn, No. 32, pp. 59-68. [In Persian]
- Avni, Gideon (1994). "Early Mosques in the Negev Highlands: New Archaeological Evidence on Islamic Penetration into Southern Palestine." *Bulletin of the American Schools of Oriental Research*, No. 294, pp. 83-100.
- Bāmdādān, Muzdak (n.d.). *Al-Masjid al-Aqṣā wa al-Qur’ān (Kashf al-Rāz min al-Aḥjīyah)*. [Masjid al-Aqsa and the Qur'an (Solving a Riddle)]. Place: Publisher not identified. [In Persian/Arabic?]

- Brombacher, David A. (2019). *Reforms in Early Qur'anic Manuscripts: Twenty Examples*. USA: Think and Tell Press.
- Brockhaus, Johannes Ebert, et al. (2011). *Der große Brockhaus Atlas zur Weltgeschichte (The Great Brockhaus Atlas of World History)*. 400 pp. Mannheim: Brockhaus Verlag.
- Bahārzādah, Parvīn and Farīdah Amīnī (1396 SH). "Conceptology and Evaluation of Narrations Indicating the Centrality of the Kaaba on Earth." *Researches in Quran and Hadith Sciences*, Spring, No. 33, pp. 1-30. [In Persian]
- Al-Bahkalī, Ḥasan Aḥmad (1387 AH). "Our Ancient History in Light of Antiquities in Our Country (3): The Construction of the Noble Kaaba." *Al-'Arab*, Year 2, Dhū al-Hijjah, Part 6, pp. 512-515.
- Bīniyāz, Dāriyūsh (2022). "In Search of Muhammad in History." Telegram Channel and Blog. Address: <https://javidnamjou.blogspot.com> › blog-post_29. [In Persian]
- Bīniyāz, Dāriyūsh (2022). "The Fabricated City of Mecca, the Achilles' Heel of Islamic Historiography." Telegram Channel Rāz-e Now. Address: <https://t.me/raazenow/149>. [In Persian]
- Pākzād, M. A. (n.d.). *The Muhammad Project (Two Volumes)*. Place: Publisher not identified. [In Persian]
- Popp, Volker (2014). *The Early Islam: From Ugarit to Samarra – A Historical Reconstruction of the Religion of Islam Based on Numismatic and Epigraphic Evidence*. Trans.: Bīniyāz, [Dariush]. Persian Print. 303 pp. Germany-Canada-France: Pūgāh / Pūyā / Khāvarān / Furūgh Publications.
- Popp, Volker; Ohlig, Karl-Heinz; Poin, Gerd-R. (Date unknown). *The Dark Beginnings of Islam: Reconstructing History Based on Inscriptions and Coins*. Trans.: Javid Namjoo. Place: Publisher not identified.
- Pūyāzādah, A'zam and Maryam Pīrvān (1393 SH). "A Critique of Gerald Hawting's View in the Book *Idolatry and the Emergence of Islam*." *Researches in Quran and Hadith Sciences*, Autumn, No. 23, pp. 33-60. [In Persian]
- Petersen, Andrew (1996). "Qibla." In: *Dictionary of Islamic Architecture*. Ed.: Andrew Petersen. New York: Routledge, p. 240.
- Pīrmarādiyān, Muṣṭafā and Mahdī 'Izzatī (1393 SH). "The Inhabitants of Mecca (A Reflection on the Settlement of Mecca's Tribes and the Population of Quraysh on the Eve of the Advent of Islam)." *Journal of the History of Islamic Culture and Civilization*, Spring, No. 14, pp. 111-134. [In Persian]

- Tājī, Īmān (1401 SH). "From the Believers' Movement to the Muslim Community: A Review of Fred Donner's Book *Muhammad and the Believers: At the Origins of Islam*." *Durunmā*, Khordad & Shahrivar, No. 7, pp. 1-7. [In Persian]
- Takhtdāriyān, Mahri and Muḥsin Iḥtimāmī Niyā (1391 SH). *Causes of the Qibla Change and its Consequences*. Master's Thesis. Islamic Azad University, Central Tehran Branch, Faculty of Literature and Humanities. [In Persian]
- Tafazzulī, ‘Abbās ‘alī (1386 SH). "The Two Qiblas (Al-Masjid al-Aqṣā & Al-Masjid al-Ḥarām)." *Journal of Jurisprudence and History of Civilization*, Year 3, Summer, No. 12, pp. 29-46. [In Persian]
- Taqīzādah Kūhbanānī, Maḥmūd and Ḥusayn Sulaymānī (1393 SH). *The Status of Sacred Places in Jewish, Christian, and Islamic Rituals*. Master's Thesis. University of Religions and Denominations, Faculty of Religions. [In Persian]
- Tawḥīdī, Amīn Riḍā and Muṣṭafā Pīrmarādiyān (1400 SH). *Politics and Pilgrimage in the Hijaz (From the Beginning to the Fall of the Abbasid Caliphate)*. 231 pp. Tehran: Mash‘ar. [In Persian]
- Ja‘fariyān, Rasūl (1374 SH). "The History of the Kaaba and Al-Masjid al-Ḥarām, [Review of] Muḥammad Ma‘šūm ibn Muḥammad Ṣāliḥ Damāvandī." *Miqāt al-Hajj*, Summer, No. 12, pp. 111-134. [In Persian]
- Ja‘fariyān, Rasūl (1375 SH). "Curtaining and Key-keeping of the Kaaba." *Miqāt al-Hajj*, Spring, No. 15, pp. 82-90. [In Persian]
- Al-Jallād, Aḥmad (1401 SH/2022 CE). "The Pre-Islamic Basmala: Reflections on the Earliest Epigraphic Attestation and its Original Significance." *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam*, Vol. 52, pp. 1–28.
- Al-Jallād, Aḥmad (2018). "The Arabic of Petra." In: *The Petra Papyri V*. Ed.: Arjava, A., Frosén, J., & Kaimio, M. Amman: American Center of Oriental Research, pp. 35–55.
- Al-Jallād, Aḥmad (2025). *The Religion and Rituals of the Pre-Islamic Arabian Nomads: A Reconstruction Based on the Ṣafaitic Inscriptions*. 310 pp. Intro. and trans. from Ohio State University. Leiden: Brill.
- Al-Jallād, Aḥmad (Date unspecified). "The Epigraphy of the Tribe of ‘Ād." (Draft).
- Al-Jallād, Aḥmad (Date unspecified). "A Pre-Islamic Divine Name and the Context of the Qur'anic Testimony concerning Jesus." (Full publication details not available).
- Al-Jallād, Aḥmad; Daniel, Robert; Al-Ghūl, ‘Umar (2013). "Arabic Geographical and Settlement Names in Petra." In: *The Petra Papyri II*.

- Ed.: Koenen, L., Kaimio, M., & Daniel, R. Amman: American Center of Oriental Research, pp. 23–48.
- Al-Jallād, Aḥmad; Al-Ṣaydakī, Hishām (1401 SH/2022 CE). "An Old Arabic Inscription on the Northern Route, Ṭā'if." *Arabian Archaeology and Epigraphy*, Vol. 33, No. 1, pp. 202–215.
- Al-Jallād, Aḥmad; Al-Ṣaydakī, Hishām (1403 SH/2024 CE). "An Old Arabic Inscription by a Companion of Muḥammad?" *Journal of Near Eastern Studies*, Vol. 83, No. 1, pp. 1–14.
- Jamshīdpūr, Ārash (1404 SH). "Islam and Petra; Evaluating Dan Gibson's Claim about the Origin of Islam from the Perspective of the Petra Papyri." Undated. Dīn Online Website. Address: <https://www.dinonline.com/44953>. [In Persian]
- Jamshīdpūr, Ārash (1404 SH). "The Petra Papyri and their Importance in Islamic and Qur'anic Studies." Undated. Dīn Online Website. Address: <https://www.dinonline.com/44227>. [In Persian]
- Jamshīdpūr, Ārash (1404 SH). "A Very Important Finding in Islamic Studies; The Inscription of Ḥanzalah bin Abī 'Āmir." Undated. Dīn Online Website. Address: <https://www.dinonline.com/43378>. [In Persian]
- Ḥāj Amīnī, Ḥamīd (1398 SH). "Mecca or Petra? A Reflection on the Hagarist Origin Hypothesis of Islam." Scientific Meeting, Khordad 21. Qom: National Center for Answering Religious Questions. [In Persian]
- Ḥasan Zādah; Ṣāliḥ (1396 SH). "Analysis of the Kaaba Narrative in the Qur'an and Hadith Based on the Verse 'Indeed, the first House [of worship] established for mankind was...'" *Journal of Miqāt al-Ḥajj*, Winter, No. 102, pp. 81-107. [In Persian]
- Ḥasanī, Sayyid 'Alī (1384 SH). "The Status of the Kaaba among Pre-Islamic Peoples and Followers of Different Religions." *Ma'rifat*, Ābān, No. 95, pp. 42-45. [In Persian]
- Al-Ḥusaynī, Sayyid Muṣṭafā and Muḥammad Taqī Anṣārīpūr (1402 SH). *Evaluating Arguments Pertaining to Inconsistencies Between Qur'anic Verses and Existing Reports in the Bible with the Current Location of Mecca*. Master's Thesis. University of Religions and Denominations, Faculty of Religions. [In Persian]
- Al-Ḥuṭlānī, 'Abdullāh Sa'd; Al-'Utaybī, 'Ajab Muḥammad (1402 SH/2023 CE). "An Old Arabic Inscription from the Ḥismā Desert (Tabūk Region)." *Arabian Archaeology and Epigraphy*, 2023, pp. 1–11.
- Khalīlīzādah, Murtaḍā (1400 SH). "Critique of the Views of Makārim Shīrāzī and Rashīd Riḍā on the History of the Kaaba's Construction in *Tafsīr al-*

- Manār and Tafṣīr-i Nimūnah.*" Fifth International Conference on Islamic Sciences, Religious Studies and Law. [In Persian]
- Khalīlī Nizhād, Sayyid Muḥsin and Ja'far Nekūnām (1399 SH). *A Comparative Study of Sacred Places in the Qur'an and the Bible and its Impact on Understanding the Qur'an.* Ph.D. Dissertation. Qom University, Faculty of Theology and Islamic Studies. [In Persian]
- Khalīlī, Hamāsah (1387 SH). "The Kaaba Covering." *Kitāb-i Māh-i Hunar, Ābān*, No. 122, pp. 30-40. [In Persian]
- Khalīlī Nizhād, Sayyid Muḥsin and Ja'far Nekūnām (1399 SH). "Critique of Gibson's Claim Regarding the Qibla Change from Petra to the Kaaba by Citing Qur'anic Verses." *Kitāb-i Qayyim*, Spring & Summer, No. 22, pp. 7-24. [In Persian]
- Donner, Fred M. (1981). *The Early Islamic Conquests.* 487 pp. USA: Princeton University Press.
- Donner, Fred M. (1998). *Narratives of Islamic Origins: The Beginnings of Islamic Historical Writing.* 385 pp. Princeton: The Darwin Press.
- Donner, Fred M. (2010). *Muhammad and the Believers: At the Origins of Islam.* approx. 300 pp. Cambridge: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.
- Donner, Fred and Hasselbach-Andee, Rebecca (Eds.) (2022). *Language, Scripts, and Crasses: Writing and Religion in Arabia, ca. 500–700 CE.* 520 pp. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Duri, Michael (2018). *The Qur'an and Its Biblical Reflexes: Investigations into the Genesis of a Religion.* Lexington Books, USA.
- Rabī' Natāj, Sayyid 'Alī Akbar and Zahrā Lāzarī (1390 SH). "An Inquiry into the Ḥadīth of 'Daḥw al-Ard'." *Ḥadīth Pazhūhī*, Spring & Summer, No. 5, pp. 273-294. [In Persian]
- Rastgār, Maryam and 'Alī Pīrhādī and Valī Allāh Naqīpūr Far (1401 SH). "Critique of the Characterization of Sarah versus Hagar and the Migration to Hijaz." *Journal of Qur'anic Teachings*, Year 19, Autumn, No. 36, pp. 121-142. [In Persian]
- Rasūlī Maḥallātī, Sayyid Hāshim (1365 SH). "The Story of the Kaaba's Reconstruction." *Pāsdār-i Islām*, Farvardīn, No. 52, pp. 28-31. [In Persian]
- Riḍā'ī, Fāṭimah and Yūnus Farahmand and Mūsā Akramī and Qanbar'alī Rūdgār (1398 SH). "Qibla Finding Based on Folk Astronomy in Andalusia." *Tārīkh wa Farhang*, Year 51, Autumn, No. 103, pp. 71-94. [In Persian]

- Rafī'ī, Muḥammad Ḥusayn (1393 SH). "Fragments of Islamic Studies (5); Islamic Studies in the West (2): Patricia Crone and the End of Orientalism." *Ā'īneye Pazhūhish*, Āzar & Esfand, Nos. 149 & 150, pp. 115-122. [In Persian]
- Reynolds, Gabriel Said (Ed.) (2008). *The Qur'ān in Its Historical Context*. London: Routledge.
- Reynolds, Gabriel Said (Ed.) (2011). *New Perspectives on the Qur'ān: The Qur'ān in Its Historical Context 2*. London: Routledge.
- Reynolds, Gabriel Said (2018). *The Qur'ān and the Bible*. Yale University Press. Group of Translators: 'Anqā'. Place: Nashr-i 'Anqā'.
- Rius-Piniés, Mònica (2023). "Which Qibla Direction is Correct?" In: Brentjes, Sonja (Ed.). *The Routledge Handbook on the Sciences in Islamicate Societies*. USA: Routledge, pp. 741–751.
- Zayn al-Ābidīn, 'Abd al-Salām (1379 SH). "Al-Ka'bah al-Musharrafah: The Secret of its Construction and Location (A Reading in the Sermon of al-Qāsi'ah)." *Miqāt al-Ḥajj* (Arabic), Autumn, No. 14, pp. 277-290.
- Robin, Christian J. (1401 SH). *1400 Years of Kingdom in Pre-Islamic Arabia*. Trans.: Muḥammad 'Alī Khwānīnzādah. 520 pp. Tehran: Ḥikmat. [In Persian]
- Sāzjīnī, Murtaḍā (1399 SH). *Critique of the Doubts in the Book "Letters for Muhammad the Prophet (PBUH)/ A Research on the Roots of the Qur'an"*. Ph.D. Dissertation. Supervisors: Raḥman 'Ushriyah, Muḥammad 'Alī Riḍā'ī Iṣfahānī. Qur'ān University, Qom Faculty of Qur'ānic Sciences. [In Persian]
- Sāzjīnī, Murtaḍā and Raḥman 'Ushriyah and Muḥammad 'Alī Riḍā'ī Iṣfahānī (1397 SH). "A Critical Analysis of the Doubt of the Qur'an Being a Collection of Letters." *Qur'ānic Theology*, Spring & Summer, No. 10, pp. 35-55. [In Persian]
- Sāzjīnī, Murtaḍā and Raḥman 'Ushriyah and Muḥammad 'Alī Riḍā'ī Iṣfahānī (1398 SH). "A Comparative Study of Ebionite Rituals and the Qur'an: Responding to the Doubt of Borrowing." *Religious Researches*, Autumn & Winter, No. 14, pp. 8-33. [In Persian]
- Sālim, 'Abd al-'Azīz (1380 SH). *Tārīkh-i 'Arab Qabl az Islām (History of the Arabs before Islam)*. Trans.: Bāqir Ṣadrī Niyā. 440 pp. Tehran: Scientific and Cultural Publications. [In Persian]
- Sāmānī, Maḥmūd, and Pazhūhishkadah-i Ḥajj wa Ziyārat (1393 SH). *Iranians' Relations with Hijaz in Different Periods of Islamic History*. 252 pp. Tehran: Mash'ar. [In Persian]

- Sargulī, Sajjād (1402-1404 SH). "Collection of Notes on the Mecca-Jerusalem Dichotomy." Telegram Channel Ilaḥiyyātīk. <https://t.me/elahiatik>. (Titles of notes concerning the Mecca-Jerusalem dichotomy, in order of writing date, include "Which Masjid al-Aqsa?", "The Temple of Jerusalem", "The Temple of Jerusalem in the Qur'an", etc., with provided URLs). [In Persian]
- Sultānī, Sayyid Muḥammad and Muḥsin al-Wa'irī and Ḥusayn Fallāḥzādah (1401 SH). "Critique of the View of the Qur'an's Emergence Based on Syriac Texts." *Qur'ān Research of Orientalists*, Spring & Summer, No. 32, pp. 152-176. [In Persian]
- Sulīkīn, Aḥmad; Dāmānhūrī, 'Abd al-Razzāq (2024). "Correlation and Regression Analysis Between Foundation Year and Qibla Direction Deviation of Friday Mosques in East Java." *Journal of Mathematics, Science, and Technology Education*, Vol. 9, No. 1, pp. 21–32.
- Sayyid Zahrān (1363 AH). "Islamic Mosques: Al-Masjid al-Ḥarām (8 & 9): The Kaaba and its Annexes." *Al-Masājid*, Year 2, Rabī' al-Awwal & Jumādā al-Ūlā, Nos. 3 & 5, pp. 329-331 & 361-362.
- Sayfullāh, Muḥammad Salīm; Ghanīm, Majdī; 'Abd al-Raḥmān, Aḥmad; Squires, Richard; Aḥmad, Muṣṭafā (2001). "The Qibla of Early Mosques: Jerusalem or Mecca?" Available at: www.islamic-awareness.org/History/Islam/Dome_of_the_Rock/qibla.html (Reviewed February 23, 2020).
- Sinai, Nicolai (2017). *The Qur'an: A Historical-Critical Introduction*. Edinburgh University Press, UK.
- Shāddel, Mahdī (2017). "Qur'anic Onomastic Studies: Al-Raqīm, the Secret of Nabataea." *Journal of Semitic Studies*, Vol. 62, pp. 303–318.
- Shāhmīrānī, Nāhīd and Zuhrah Akhavan Muqaddam (1395 SH). "A Comparative Study of the Opinions of Sunni and Shi'a Commentators on the Nature and Location of Al-Bayt al-Ma'mūr." *Comparative Tafsir Studies*, Spring & Summer, No. 1, pp. 87-106. [In Persian]
- Al-Shu'ār, Mahā (1442 AH). "The History of Using Precious Materials in Adorning Religious Buildings - The Noble Kaaba as a Model." *Āfāq al-Thaqāfah wa al-Turāth*, Rajab, No. 113, pp. 112-136.
- Shafī'ī Khūzānī, Sa'īd (1393 SH). "The Oldest Non-Islamic Writings on the Emergence of Islam and the Qur'an." *Iranian and Islamic Historical Researches*, Spring & Summer, No. 14, pp. 113-140. [In Persian]
- Shafī'ī Khūzānī, Sa'īd (1398 SH). "A Survey of Trends in Qur'anic Historical Studies in the West (With a Critical Approach to the New Skepticism

- Trend)." *Qur'an and Hadith Researches*, Year 52, Spring, No. 1, pp. 69-93. [In Persian]
- Shakuryān, Nāṣir (1385 SH). "The Names, Characteristics, and Rulings of the Kaaba in the Qur'an." *Miqāt al-Ḥajj*, Year 14, Spring, No. 55. [In Persian]
- Shantah, Ḥasan Yāsīn and Sayyid 'Alī Riḍā Asharfī Qamarūdī (1397 SH). *Determining the Qibla Direction and Distance to Mecca*. Master's Thesis. Kāshān University, Faculty of Mathematical Sciences. [In Persian]
- Schumm, William R. (2020). "How Accurately Could Early Muslims (622–900 CE) Determine the Direction of the Qibla?" *Religions*, Vol. 11, No. 102, pp. 1–16.
- Schumm, William R.; Ferguson, Alan D.; Hashmat, Muhammad S.; Niu, Tom Li (2005). "Contradictory Differences Between Islam and Christianity: A Statistical Comparison." *Islam and Christian–Muslim Relations*, Vol. 16, No. 2, pp. 167–185.
- Schumm, William R.; Crawford, David W.; Barki, Peter E.; Bush, Daniel; Bush, David W. (2021). "Using Statistics to Analyze Anthropological/Religious Issues from the Deep Past." *Anthropological Insights*, Vol. 5, No. 1, pp. 337–346.
- Schumm, William R.; Goldstein, Zachary (2021). "A Statistical Evaluation of Early Islamic History and Qibla: Comparing the Theories of David King and Dan Gibson." *Open Access Journal of Archaeology & Anthropology*, Vol. 3, No. 1, pp. 1–20.
- Schumm, William R.; Goldstein, Zachary (2023, a). "Statistical Analysis of Qibla Data." Chapter 3 in: Dan Gibson, *Let the Stones Speak: Archaeology Challenges Islam*. Canada: Independent Scholars Press / CanBooks, pp. 39–56.
- Schumm, William R.; Goldstein, Zachary (2023, b). "A Statistical Test of David King's Qibla Theory." Appendix 3 in: Dan Gibson, *Let the Stones Speak: Archaeology Challenges Islam*. Canada: Independent Scholars Press / CanBooks, pp. 322–327.
- Shoemaker, Stephen J. (2003). "Christmas in the Qur'an: The Qur'anic Account of Jesus' Nativity and Palestinian Local Tradition." *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam*, No. 28, pp. 11–39.
- Ṣabbāghī, Ṣābir and Maṅṣūr Pahlavān (1393 SH). *The Change of Qibla from the Perspective of the Qur'an and Narrations and a Critique of Orientalists' Views*. Master's Thesis. University of Tehran, Faculty of Theology and Islamic Studies. [In Persian]

- Şabrī Pāshā, Ayyūb and Sayyid ‘Alī Qāzī ‘Askar (1378 SH). "Construction Around the Kaaba." *Miqāt al-Ḥajj*, Autumn, No. 29, pp. 123-129. [In Persian]
- Şafarī Farūshānī, Ni‘mat Allāh (1404 SH). *The Fallacy of Mecca or Petra (Parts 1 & 2; A Discussion from the 16th Session of the Workshop on Citation Fallacies)*. Eitaa
Address: <https://eitaa.com/joinchat/3117417555C0aced68c60>. [In Persian]
- Tarjān Yilmaz (1381 SH). "The Kaaba and its Historical-Artistic Objects." Trans.: Muḥammad Riḍā Ni‘matī. *Miqāt al-Ḥajj*, Summer, Nos. 39, 40, 41, 42, pp. 115-132, 91-112, 101-111, 142-170. [In Persian]
- ‘Ādil ‘Abd al-‘Azīz, Muḥammad (1430 AH). "Al-Ka‘bah bayn al-Islām wa al-‘Ilm." *Minbar al-Islām*, Year 68, Dhū al-Qa‘dah, No. 11, pp. 31-32.
- ‘Abbās, Waḥīd and Muḥammad Riḍā Sāzmand (1401 SH). *Examining the Qibla Verses from the Perspective of Commentators from the 1st to the end of the 6th Century AH*. Master's Thesis. Al-Muṣṭafā International University, Higher Education Complex of Jurisprudence. [In Persian]
- ‘Abbāsī, Jawād and Miḥnāz Mūsawī Muqaddam (1390 SH). "A Study of the Relations of Shāhrukh Tīmūr with the Mamluks - Based on Efforts to Change the Kaaba Covering." *History of Foreign Relations*, Summer, No. 47, pp. 97-120. [In Persian]
- ‘Abd al-Ghanī Muḥammad ‘Abd Allāh (1396 AH). "'Imārat al-Ka‘bah ḥattā al-‘Aṣr al-Umawī." *Al-Wa‘y al-Islāmī*, Year 12, Dhū al-Ḥijjah, No. 144, pp. 68-79.
- ‘Abd Allāhpūr, Nasrīn and Maḥb‘alī Ābsālān (1395 SH). *A Study of Sacred Places and Times in the Holy Qur'an*. Master's Thesis. University of Sistan and Baluchestan, Faculty of Theology. [In Persian]
- ‘Alawī, Sayyid Ḥusayn and Muḥammad Jawād Iskandarlū (1396 SH). "Ḥajj from the Perspective of Orientalists (With Emphasis on the *Encyclopedia of the Qur'an*, Leiden)." *Journal of Miqāt al-Ḥajj*, Autumn, No. 101, pp. 105-126. [In Persian]
- ‘Alī, Aḥmad (1375 SH). *Ḥijāz dar Ṣadr-i Islām (Ḥijāz in Early Islam: A Study of its Civil and Administrative Conditions)*. Trans.: ‘Abd al-Muḥammad Āyatī. 608 pp. Tehran: Mash‘ar. [In Persian]
- Al-Ghūl, ‘Umar (1999). "Building Names in Greek Papyrus No. 10 from Petra." *Proceedings of the Seminar for Arabian Studies*, Vol. 29, pp. 67–71.
- Al-Ghūl, ‘Umar (2006). "Preliminary Notes on the Arabic Material in the Petra Papyri." *Topoi*, Vol. 14/1, pp. 139–169.

- Fāṭimī, Sayyid Ḥasan (1399 SH). "In Which Mosque, Which Month, and Which Prayer Did the Qibla Change Occur?" *Journal of Miqāt al-Ḥajj*, Autumn, No. 113, pp. 115-139. [In Persian]
- Firestone, Reuven (2019). "Muhammad, the Jews, and the Composition of the Qur'an: Sacred History and Counter-History." *Religions*, Vol. 10, No. 63, pp. 1-14.
- Farshīdiyān Pūr, Ṣādiqah and Bahādar Qaym (1399 SH). *The Guardianship of Mecca from the Prophet's Era to the End of the Abbasid Period*. Master's Thesis. Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz, Faculty of Literature and Humanities. [In Persian]
- Farhang, Muḥammad Riḍā (1376 SH). "Places and Artifacts: A Report on the Two Reconstructions of the Kaaba and Al-Masjid al-Ḥarām." *Miqāt al-Ḥajj*, Summer, No. 20, pp. 103-114. [In Persian]
- Fikrat, Āṣif (1372 SH). "Places and Artifacts: The Khorasanian Garment on the Kaaba's Frame." *Miqāt al-Ḥajj*, Autumn, No. 5, pp. 123-136. [In Persian]
- Fatāḥiyān Barāzandah, Līlā and 'Alī Riḍā Ushtarī Tafrashī (1395 SH). *The Place of Patricia Crone's Studies in Western Islamic Studies*. Master's Thesis. Imam Khomeini International University, Faculty of Theology and Islamic Studies. [In Persian]
- Fisher, Greg & McDonald, Michael; Cerchia, Aldo; Daryae, Touraj; Gibbs, Matt; Levin, Arin; Violante, Donata; Whately, Conor (1400 SH). *Arabs and Empires before Islam*. Trans.: Mahnāz Bābā'ī. 152 pp. Tehran: Murvārīd. [In Persian]
- Qurbān Nizhād, Parīsā and Nāṣir 'Ayyārī (1398 SH). "A Comparative Study of Muslim Travelers' Accounts of the Kaaba and Al-Masjid al-Ḥarām (3rd-8th Centuries AH)." *Journal of the History of Islamic Culture and Civilization*, Winter, No. 37, pp. 53-68. [In Persian]
- Qashshāsh, Aḥmad bin Sa'īd (2015). *Nuqūsh al-Ṣaḥābī al-Jalīl Khālid bin al-'Āṣ wa Abnā' ihī fī Minṭaqat al-Bāḥah*. Beirut: Mu'assasat al-Intishār al-'Arabī.
- Qaḍā'ī, Amīn (n.d.). *Nāmah 'hāyī barāy-i Muḥammad Payghambar (A Research on the Roots of the Qur'an)*. Place: Publisher not identified. [In Persian]
- Kāzīmī, Muḥammad Ḥusayn and Zahrā Rūḥ Allāhī Amīrī (1401 SH). "Social and Doctrinal Characteristics among Arabs Contemporary with the Advent of Islam in the Poems of Khansā'." *Sukhan-i Tārīkh*, Year 16, Spring, No. 37, pp. 114-137. [In Persian]

- Calder, Norman (1988). Review of *The First Dynasty of Islam* by G.R. Hawting. *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*, Vol. 51, No. 1, February.
- Kaegi, Walter E. (1991). *Byzantium and the Early Islamic Conquests*. Cambridge University Press, UK.
- Crone, Patricia and Cook, Michael (1977). *Hagarism: The Making of the Islamic World*. approx. 150 pp. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Crone, Patricia (1987). *Meccan Trade and the Rise of Islam*. approx. 250 pp. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Crone, Patricia (1389 SH). *Tārīkh-i Andīshah-i Siyāsī dar Islām (History of Political Thought in Islam)*. Trans.: Mas'ūd Ja'farī. 756 pp. Tehran: Sukhan. [In Persian]
- Crone, Patricia (1990). "Review of *The Origins of Islam*." *Journal of Islamic Studies*, Vol. 18, No. 4, pp. 95–120.
- Crone, Patricia (1994). *Early Islam: History, Sources, and Traditions* (with Martin Hinds). 280 pp. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Crone, Patricia (1998). "A Critique of Early Islamic Sources." *Journal of Middle East History*, Vol. 22, No. 2, pp. 75–105.
- Crone, Patricia (2003). *Islam, History, and Civilization*. 360 pp. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Crone, Patricia (2005). "How Did the Qur'anic Pagans Make a Living?" *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*, Vol. 68, No. 3, pp. 387–399.
- Karīmpūr, Sa'īd (1393 SH). *Abrahamic Religions and the Issue of the Promised Prophet: A New Look at the Glad Tidings in the Torah and Gospel about the Prophet of Islam (PBUH)*. 280 pp. Tehran: Āmah. (Regarding the non-alignment of Mecca and Paran, a 70-page appendix is included at the end of the book). [In Persian]
- Karīmpūr, Sa'īd and 'Alī Rād (1395 SH). "Analysis and Critique of the Hypothesis of Samaritan Influence on Islam." *Theological Researches Quarterly*, Autumn, No. 14, pp. 103-118. [In Persian]
- Karīmpūr, Sa'īd and 'Alī Rād (1395 SH). *Analysis and Critique of Hagarism Based on Qur'anic Verses and Islamic Narrations*. Master's Thesis. University of Tehran, Farabi Campus - Faculty of Theology. [In Persian]
- Karīmpūr, Sa'īd and 'Alī Rād (1396 SH). "The Hypothesis of the Hagarist Origin of Islam, Analysis and Critique." *Philosophy of Religion*, Vol. 4, No. 14, pp. 769-786. [In Persian]
- Karīmī Kandarūd, Āydā and Mihrān Ismā'īlī (1395 SH). *A Comparative Study of the Relations of Quraysh Tribes during the Prophet's Era*. Master's

- Thesis. Shahid Beheshti University, Faculty of Theology and Religions. [In Persian]
- Karīmī Niyā, Murtaḍā (1386 SH). *Sīrah Research in the West: Selected Texts and Sources*. 904 pp. Tehran: The World Forum for Proximity of Islamic Schools of Thought. [In Persian]
- Cook, Michael (1388 SH). "A Semantic Hadith on the Qibla in al-Kulaynī's *al-Kāfī*." Trans.: Sayyid Ḥasan Islāmī. *ʿUlūm-i Ḥadīth*, Spring, No. 51, pp. 150-170. [In Persian]
- Cook, Michael (1977). *The Emergence of Islam*. 295 pp. London: Cambridge University Press.
- Cook, Michael (1980). "Review of Early Muslim Dogma." *Journal of Islamic Studies*, Vol. 17, No. 1, pp. 45–78.
- Cook, Michael (1983). *Muhammad*. 320 pp. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Cook, Michael (1985). "An Historical Analysis of the Origins of Islam." *Journal of Middle East History*, Vol. 20, No. 2, pp. 60–90.
- King, David A. (1983). "On the Qibla of al-Bīrūnī in Early Islamic Transoxania." *History of Arabic Sciences*, May & October 1983, Vol. 7, Nos. 1 & 2, pp. 132–158.
- King, David A. (1986). "Kibla." In: *Encyclopaedia of Islam, Second Edition*. Leiden: Brill, Vol. 5, pp. 82–88.
- King, David A. (1990). "Science in the Service of Religion: The Case of Islam." *Impact of Science on Society*, Vol. 40, No. 3, pp. 245–262.
- King, David A. (1993). "Astronomy in the Service of Religion: The Case of Islam." In: Ruggles, C.L.N. & Saunders, N.J. (Eds.). *Astronomies and Cultures: Papers from the Third Oxford International Symposium on Archaeoastronomy, St. Andrews, UK, September 1990*. USA: University Press of Colorado, pp. 124–138.
- King, David A. (1996). "Astronomy and Islamic Society: Qibla, Gnomonics, and Timekeeping." In: Rashed, R. (Ed.). *Encyclopedia of the History of Arabic Science*. Vol. 3: Technology, Alchemy and Life Sciences. USA: Taylor & Francis, pp. 128–184.
- King, David A. (2000). "Mathematical Astronomy in Islamic Civilisation." In: Selin, H. (Ed.). *Astronomy Across Cultures: The History of Non-Western Astronomy*. Netherlands: Springer, pp. 585–613.
- King, David A. (2016). *Islamic Astronomy and Geography*. USA: Routledge.
- King, David A. (2018–2019). "A Review of *Early Islamic Qiblas*." *Suhayl: Journal for the History of the Exact and Natural Sciences in Islamic Civilisation*, Nos. 16–17, pp. 347–366.

- King, David A. (2018). "The Petra Fallacy: Early Mosques Do Face the Sacred Kaaba in Mecca, But Dan Gibson Doesn't Know How." Available at: www.davidaking.academia.edu (Reviewed November 26, 2019).
- King, David A. (2020). "Islamic Sacred Geography and the Determination of the Qibla using the Sun and Stars: A Survey of Historical Sources with an Appendix on Some Recent Errors in Mosque Orientations." *Journal of Arabic-Islamic History of Science*, No. 22, pp. 91–141.
- King, David A. (2024). "Mistakes about Early Islam: Dan Gibson and Amos J. Dheus on the Sacred Direction (Qibla) and Tom Holland on Prayer Rituals." *Science and Engineering in the Islamic Heritage*. Center for the Study of Islamic Manuscripts, Al-Furqan Islamic Heritage Foundation, Lebanon, pp. 23–58.
- King, David A. (2024). "The Kaaba and the Sacred Geography of Islam: Revisiting 'The Faces of the Kaaba' (1982)." [Unpublished].
- Grasso, Valentina (2021). *Pre-Islamic Arabia: Societies, Politics, Cults and Identities during Late Antiquity*. approx. 350 pp. London: Oxford University Press.
- Griffith, Sidney H. (2008). "Christian Lore and the Arabic Qur'an: The 'Companions of the Cave' in Sūrat al-Kahf and in Syriac Christian Tradition." In: Reynolds, Gabriel Said (Ed.). *The Qur'ān in Its Historical Context*. London: Routledge, pp. 109–138. (This article was translated into Persian by Mr. Zuhayr Mīkarīmī as "Ma'ārif-i Masīhī wa Qur'ān-i 'Arabī" and published on the 'Anqā' channel).
- Gibson, Dan (2011). *Qur'anic Geography: A Survey and Evaluation of Geographical References in the Qur'an with Reference to Historical and Field Data*. 470 pp. Canada: Independent Scholars Press.
- Gibson, Dan (2016). *The Sacred City*. Television documentary directed by David Taylor, 85 min., produced in the UK.
- Gibson, Dan (2017). *Early Islamic Qiblas: A Study of Mosques Built Between 1 AH / 622 CE and 263 AH / 876 CE*. 320 pp., Vancouver, Canada: Independent Scholars Press.
- Gibson, Dan (2023). *Let the Stones Speak: A New Look at the Archeology of Islam*. 270 pp., Canada: Independent Scholars Press / CanBooks.
- Larsson, Göran (2012). "History is Back! Implications of Critical Studies of Early Islam for Scholarship and Education." *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations*, Vol. 23, pp. 531–537.
- Lecker, Michael (n.d.). "A Short Critique of Gibson's Views." doi: 10.1093/jss/fgu020.

- Lecker, Michael (2014). "Review of *Qur'ānic Geography*." *Journal of Semitic Studies*, Vol. 59, pp. 465–467.
- Langroudi, Armin (2018). "On the Mythical Backgrounds of Mecca and the Kaaba." Published on Academia.edu. Available from: [https://www.academia.edu/37326670/...](https://www.academia.edu/37326670/)
- Luxenberg, Christoph (2000). *Die syro-aramäische Lesart des Koran: Ein Beitrag zur Entschlüsselung der Koransprache*. 350 pp., Berlin: Hans-Schiler-Verlag. Persian translation: Luxenberg, Christoph (2020). *The Syro-Aramaic Reading of the Quran: An Inquiry into Deciphering the Language of the Quran*, trans. B. Bīniyāz (Dariush), 323 pp., Cologne: Forugh Publications.
- Luxenberg, Christoph (2021). "The Abbasid Separation from Umayyad (Eastern/Unitarian) Christianity." A dialogue with Sami Awed Al-Theeb, n.p.
- Maier, Christian; van Ess, Professor Josef (2013). "The Origins of Islam: The Formation and Consolidation of the Islamic Religion in a Conversation between Christian Maier and Professor Josef van Ess, German Islamologist." *Iranian-Islamic Studies*, Autumn, No. 6, pp. 167–174.
- Abū Shuhbah, Muḥammad Muḥammad (1967). "Taḥwīl al-Qiblah ilā al-Ka'bah; ilā ayyati jihatīn kāna yuṣallī al-Rasūl qabla al-Hijrah matā kāna al-taḥwīl lil-Ka'bah?" [The Change of the Qibla to the Kaaba; Towards which direction did the Prophet pray before the Hijra? When was the change to the Kaaba?]. *Al-Wa'y al-Islāmī*, Year 2, Sha'bān, No. 20, pp. 16–19.
- ʿAkkāshah, Muḥammad Na'im (1980). "Al-Ka'bah al-Musharrafah awwal bayt wuḍi'a lil-nās" [The Honoured Kaaba, the First House Established for Mankind]. *Al-Azhar*, Year 52, Dhū al-Hijjah, Part 9, pp. 1735–1739.
- Al-Shahrī, Muḥammad Hazzā' Mahdī (2013). "'Imārat al-Ka'bah al-Musharrafah fī 'ahd Quraysh" [The Construction of the Honoured Kaaba in the Era of the Quraysh]. *Umm al-Qurā University*, Dhū al-Qa'dah, No. 58, pp. 219–281.
- Mohammad, Khalil (2018). "Islam and Genesis 17: A Study in Intertextuality." *Religions*, Vol. 9, No. 293, pp. 1–14.
- Mohammadi, Abdolhossein; Molaei Niya, Izzatollah (2007). *The Performance of Hajj in Islamic History (First Century AH)*. MA Thesis, Al-Mustafa International University, Faculty of Theology and Islamic Studies.
- American Center of Oriental Research (2018). *The Petra Papyri I–V* (5-volume set). Amman: American Center of Oriental Research.

- Mazloomi, Javad (2004). "Places and Artifacts: The Names of the Kaaba's Pillars." *Miqat Hajj*, Winter, Nos. 50, 52, 53, pp. 49–74, 75–94, 129–150.
- Motamedrad, Mohammad Hossein (2022). "Introduction and Recognition of the Rulers of Mecca, from the Beginning to the Period of the Four Rightly-Guided Caliphs." *Quarterly Journal of Growth in History Education*, Autumn, Serial No. 81, pp. 23–27.
- Monnan, Khurshid Alam (2023). *Revisiting Prophet Muhammad, Mecca, and the Beqaa Valley: A Composite Method Based on the Qur'anic Model and Contemporary Research*. Preprint, Center for Academic and Professional Career Development (CAPCDR), Center No. 200, Anaconda, Upashi 8023, Bangladesh.
- Montazer Mahdi, Majid (n.d.). "Short Note on the Qibla and its Direction." Twitter site: @Majid Montazer Mahdi.
- Morris, Ian D. (2018). "Mecca and Macoraba." *Al-'Uşūr al-Wuṣṭā*, Vol. 26, No. 1. <https://doi.org/10.7916/alusur.v26i1.6850>
- Mousavi Moghaddam, Seyyed Mohammad; Mowdab, Seyyed Reza (2015). "An Examination of the New Skepticism Theory Concerning the Character and Biography of the Prophet (PBUH)." *Studies in Evolution in the Humanities*, Autumn-Winter, No. 5, pp. 46–80.
- Mousavi Moghaddam, Seyyed Mohammad (2013). *A Survey of Sirah Research Trends in the West, with Emphasis on the Views of William Montgomery Watt*. 719 pp., Qom: University of Qur'anic Sciences and Education.
- Mahdavi Charmi, Hadi; Rohi, Alireza; Mojtavavi, Hossein (2021). "The Letters of the Prophet (PBUH) to the Kings and Montgomery Watt's Ideas on the Subject." *History of Islam*, Year 22, Summer, No. 2 (Serial 86), pp. 7–44.
- Mahdikhani Sarvojahani, Seyyed Hassan (2013). "A Critique of Mas'udi's Report on the Iranians' Attention to the Kaaba in the Pre-Islamic Era." *History and Islamic Civilization*, Spring-Summer, No. 17, pp. 41–58.
- Mirdamadi, Yaser (2017). "The Origins of Islam (A Conversation between Christian Maier and Josef van Ess, German Islamologist)." Published August 1. Available at: <http://mohammadmojtahedshabestari.com>
- Mirkarimi, Zuhair (2022). "A Report on Some Researchers' Findings Regarding Inscriptions and Rock Inscriptions in Arabia during the Ancient and Early Islamic Periods and their Implications for Religious Studies." Host: Quranic Discussions Association, January 18, Anqa Telegram Channel. Available at: <https://t.me/anqanotes/601>

- Mirkarimi, Zuhair (2022). "Critiques, Views, and Questions (A Report on Some Researchers' Findings Regarding Inscriptions and Rock Inscriptions in Arabia during the Ancient and Early Islamic Periods and their Implications for Religious Studies)." Host: Quranic Discussions Association, January 18, Anqa Telegram Channel. Available at: <https://t.me/anqanotes/605>
- Nassarat, Mohammad Ibrahim A.; Twaysi, Sa'd Ahmad A. (2016). "The Titles of Petra in the Sixth Century." *Arabian Archaeology and Epigraphy*, Vol. 27, pp. 208–214.
- Nassarat, Mohammad Ibrahim A. (2019). "Petra, Taxes and Trade; A Reassessment Using the Petra Church Archive." *Palestine Exploration Quarterly*, Vol. 151, No. 1, pp. 50–68.
- Naseri Karimvand, Amanollah; Akbarnejad, Mahdi; Shamkhi, Mina (2020). "An Inquiry into the Reality of Bayt al-Ma'mur with an Approach to Analyzing Narratives." *Dynamic in Humanities Education*, Summer, Serial No. 19, pp. 39–49.
- Nazemian Fard, Ali (2009). "The Ilaf of Quraysh and its Impact on the Economic and Social Life of Mecca in the Pre-Islamic Era." *History of Islam and Iran*, Year 19, Summer, No. 2, pp. 104–126.
- Anonymous (2025). "In Search of the Kaaba (The Origin of Islam: Petra, Iraq, or Central Asia – Balkh?)." Naqdagin Website. Address: @Naqdagin
- Anonymous (n.d.). "Mecca or Petra? A Reflection on the Hagarist Origin Hypothesis of Islam." Religious Questions Answering Website.
- Anonymous (n.d.). "A Critique of the Documentary *The Sacred City*." Anti-Shobahat Website.
- Unknown (2016). *The Syriac Chronicle Known as the Khuzistan Chronicle (An Account of the Final Years of the Sasanian Empire)*, trans. Khodadad Rezakhani, Sajjad Amiri Bavandpour. 198 pp., Tehran: Hekmat Sina.
- Al-Najjār, Al-Ṭayyib Ḥasan (1949). "Taḥwīl al-Qiblah min Bayt al-Maqdis ilā al-Ka‘bah" [The Change of the Qibla from Jerusalem to the Kaaba]. *Al-Azhar*, Vol. 20, Rabi‘ al-Awwal, No. 3, pp. 221–225.
- Najafi, Hamid Reza; Diyari Bidgoli, Mohammad Taghi (2002). *Prophet Abraham (AS) in the Quran and the Testaments*. MA Thesis, Qom University, Faculty of Theology.
- Nasaji Zavareh, Esmail (2001). "Descriptions of the Kaaba." *Lessons from the School of Islam*, Vol. 41, Dey, No. 10, pp. 66–69.
- Nasr Esfahani, Behnam; Kajbaf, Ali Akbar; Montazer al-Qaem, Asghar (2023). "A Comparative Study of the Representation of the Sirah of the Prophet (PBUH) and Islamic History in the Books *Hagarism* and *The*

- Face of Muhammad.*" *Historical Science Research*, Autumn, No. 35, pp. 107–126.
- Nosrati, Sepideh; Elmi, Ghorban; Gozashteh, Nasser (2017). "A Review and Critique of Patricia Crone's Revisionist Views in the Field of Islamic Studies." *History and Islamic Civilization*, Spring-Summer, No. 25, pp. 121–147.
- Nouri Zanjanj, Mohammad Esmail (2016). "Verses Related to Events; The Reconstruction of the Kaaba by Abraham and Ishmael (Peace be upon them)." *Moballegan*, Mordad-Shahrivar, No. [Missing], pp. 23–33.
- Nouri Zanjanj, Mohammad Esmail (2016). "Verses Related to Events; The Change of the Qibla from Jerusalem to the Kaaba." *Moballegan*, Farvardin-Ordibehesht, No. 201, pp. 11–24.
- Nevo, Yehuda D.; Koren, Judith (2003). *Crossroads to Islam: The Origins of the Arab Religion and the Arab State*. 462 pp., Amherst, New York: Prometheus Books.
- Wagh, Daniel C. (2012). "Review of *Qur'ānic Geography*." *The Silk Road*, No. 10, p. 201.
- Watt, W. Montgomery (1953). *Muhammad: Prophet and Statesman*. 450 pp., London: Oxford University Press. Persian translation: Watt, Montgomery (1965). *Muhammad, Prophet and Statesman*, trans. Esmail Valizadeh, Tehran: Islamiyah Bookstore.
- Watt, W. Montgomery (1958). "The Early Development of Islam: A Historical Survey." *Journal of Islamic Studies*, Year 20, No. 3, pp. 100–135.
- Watt, W. Montgomery (1961). *Islam and the Arabs*. 520 pp., London: Oxford University Press.
- Watt, W. Montgomery (1965). "The Life of Muhammad and the Origin of Islam." *Journal of Middle East History*, Year 25, No. 1, pp. 50–80.
- Webb, Peter (2023). "The History and Importance of Mecca – Hajj: From Pre-Islam to the Rise of the Abbasids." c. 30 pp., n.p.: Published on . Academia.edu.
- Wansbrough, John (1977). *Quranic Studies: Sources and Methods of Scriptural Interpretation*. c. 200 pp., Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Wansbrough, John (1978). *The Sectarian Milieu: Content and Composition of Islamic Salvation History*. c. 200 pp., Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Vakili, Shervin (2022). "The Inarah School in Islamic Historiography." Personal Weblog, March 6. Address: <https://www.soshians.net/fa>
- Al-Walī, Tāhā (1979). "Al-Ka'bah al-Mu'azzamah wa marāḥil binā'ihā fī al-tārīkh" [The Great Kaaba and the Stages of its Construction throughout History]. *Al-Wa'y al-Islāmī*, Year 14, Dhū al-Ḥijjah, No. 168, pp. 68–78.

- Wittke, Anne-Maria; Olshausen, Eckhart; Szydlak, Richard (2009). *Historischer Atlas der antiken Welt* [Historical Atlas of the Ancient World]. Special edition of *Der Neue Pauly*. 308 pp., Stuttgart, Germany: J.B. Metzler.
- Holland, Tom (2012). *In the Shadow of the Sword: The Battle for Global Empire and the End of the Ancient World*. c. 544 pp., UK: Little, Brown.
- Hawting, Gerald R. (2007). *The Umayyads: The First Dynasty to Rule in Islam (661 - 750 CE)*, trans. Isa Abdi. 196 pp., Tehran: Amir Kabir, Franklin Pocket Books Co.
- Hawting, Gerald R. (2025). *Collection: 'The Kaaba and Hajj in Early Islam from the Perspective of Gerald R. Hawting'* (The Connection of the Kaaba with Hajj in Early Islam: First Article 'A Playground for Kings? The Hadith of Aisha, Ibn al-Zubayr and the Reconstruction of the Kaaba'; Second Article 'Ibn al-Zubayr, the Kaaba and the Dome of the Rock'; etc.). Anqa Telegram Channel. Address: <https://t.me/anqanotes/786>
- Hawting, Gerald R. (1999). *The Idea of Idolatry and the Emergence of Islam: From Polemic to History*. Cambridge University, UK. Persian translation (2007): *The Idea of Idolatry and the Emergence of Islam: From Polemic to History*, trans. A'zam Pouyazadeh, Maryam Pirovan. 332 pp., Tehran: Hekmat.
- Hawting, G.R. (2000). *Studies in Islamic and Middle Eastern Texts and Traditions in Memory of Norman Calder*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Herrera-Casais, Mónica; Schmidl, Petra G. (2008). "The Earliest Known Islamic Mapping of the Sacred Geography." In: Akasoy, Anna; Raven, Wim (Eds.), *Islamic Thought in the Middle Ages: Studies in Text, Transmission and Translation, in Honour of Hans Daiber*. Leiden: Brill, pp. 275–300.
- Hemmati, Mohammad Ali; Shaker, Mohammad Kazem (2016). *Report, Critique and Analysis of Christoph Luxenberg's Views in 'The Syro-Aramaic Reading of the Quran'*. Qom: Faculty of Principles of Religion.
- Hindi, Mubarak Ali (2010). "The History of the Construction of the Kaaba," trans. Hossein Vatheghi. *Miqat Hajj*, Spring, No. 71, pp. 117–146.
- Healey, John F. (2000). *The Religion of the Nabataeans: A Conspectus*. Leiden; Boston; Köln: Brill, pp. 56–57.
- Yadegari, Maryam; Mousavi, Seyyed Reza (2017). *The Description of Mecca in Arabic Hajj Travelogues, A Case Study (Ibn Jubayr, Mazini, Muhammad Husayn Haykal, Shakib Arsalan)*. MA Thesis, Shahid Madani University of Azerbaijan.

Yildirim, Fatih; Qazi, Fakhruddin; Shahin, Suleyman Lutfi; Ozon, Burak (2025). "The Issue of Qibla Direction in Large-Scale Maps and its Representation with Geodetic Accuracy: A Case Study in Turkey." *International Journal of Engineering and Geosciences*, Vol. 10, No. 2, pp. 151–163.

Additional Key Sources:

Crone, Patricia; Cook, Michael (1977). *Hagarism: The Making of the Islamic World*. 296 pp., Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Cook, Michael (2015). "Obituary for Patricia Crone." *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*, Vol. 78, No. 1, pp. 1–4.

King, David A. (2018–2019). "Review of Early Islamic Qiblas." *Suhayl: Journal for the History of the Exact and Natural Sciences in Islamic Civilisation*, No. 16–17, pp. 347–366.

Gibson, Dan (2011). *Qur'ānic Geography: A Survey and Evaluation of the Geographical References in the Qur'ān with Suggested Solutions for Various Problems and Issues*. 240 pp., Independent Scholars Press.

Gibson, Dan (2017). **Early Islamic Qiblas: A Study of Mosques Built Between 1 AH / 622 CE and 263 AH / 876 CE**. 320 pp., Canada: Independent Scholars Press.

Hoyland, Robert (2015). "Patricia Crone (1945–2015)." Introduction in *Islamic Cultures, Islamic Contexts: Essays in Honour of Professor Patricia Crone*. Leiden: Brill. See also: *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, Vol. 135, No. 1, pp. 103–105.